



## **Summary of the Consultation for Decision-Makers on Implementing Sustainable Transport**

*New York City, USA, September 26<sup>th</sup> 2013 attended by 67 participants from all region.*

Organized by  
UN DESA, Ford Foundation, FIA Foundation and UN Habitat

### **UNDESA**

It is important to help the political processes underway to integrate sustainable transport in a way that is acceptable, relevant to policy-makers, attractive, communicable, measurable and monitorable. Sustainable transport will feature in a number of processes which will help to define the post-2015 development agenda, including the work of the OWG on SDGs, the committee of experts on financing sustainable development and the 2014 international SIDS conference. The Rio+20 outcome sets the overall political chapeau for the work on sustainable transport and highlights the contribution of sustainable transport towards economic growth, integration of the economy (rural-urban linkages), environmental protection, social equity, health and road safety. The Rio+20 outcome underlines the importance of an integrated approach and the development of systems. We have political momentum; now we need to better understand how to proceed.

Transportation has not always been at the fore of the development agenda. It is crucial in mitigating climate change as it offers multiple leverage points, where influence can be exerted. There is a need for the creation of transport as its own individual SGD.

There are four main challenges which are also priorities for the **Ford Foundation**:

- 1) Social dimension of sustainable development: while there is a robust understanding of the relationship between economic growth, environmental sustainability and transport, the relationship between transport and the social dimension of sustainable development remains poorly understood. Therefore, there is a need for a better definition of this relationship in the post-2015 development agenda.
- 2) Gender: transport and public safety is currently dominated by men. With a growing middle class, women's labor market participation increases and so does their demand for transport services; their public safety remains at risk and there is a need to integrate gender considerations into the transport sector.
- 3) Urban development: when measuring development it is important that we not only take into account what is being built, but also what effect it has on people's everyday lives and to ensure that the benefits accrue to the necessary population.

The **International Energy Agency** has developed a mobility model (MoMo), which is a simulation model based on a very extensive data set since the 1990s. It provides an evaluation of future energy requirements and focuses on three potential scenarios, namely: 1) Business As Usual scenario or +6 degrees), normal policies scenario or +4 degrees; and 3) a pathway to clean energy system scenario or +2 degrees.

A lot of action would need to be undertaken by the transport sector (reducing demand for transport services) in order to attain the +2 degrees scenario. A so-called 'avoid, shift and improve' approach is recommended to attain the +2 degrees scenario goal in the most cost-effective manner. There is, however, more than one way of attaining this goal.

Over the past 30 years we have seen huge investments into road infrastructure whereas rail investment has remained stable, reflecting the difference in preferences. It is much more cost-effective to build a sustainable transport system rather than a conventional one. Financial flows would need to shift from operating costs (mainly fuel) to investment costs (infrastructure for mass transit, efficient vehicles) if 2DS is to be reached.). It is important to highlight the key role of governments and Multilateral Development Banks in supporting this long term vision through targeted transport investments.

Building a sustainable transport system is not only important for attaining climate objectives but also a number of other objectives, including safety aspects, environmental considerations, energy security (oil demand). Furthermore, a low carbon trajectory for the transport sector will provide substantial economic savings over the next 4 decades; when taking Vehicle purchase, fuel spending and vehicles infrastructures needed, over 50 trillion dollars can be saved by 2050, or about 10% of the money to be spent on the transport sector. Reducing the fuel import bills will allow for a stimulation of local economies leading to a more sustainable economic growth.

## UNECE

Transport is important for poverty eradication because it provides access to markets and supply chains of intermediate outputs. As such, studies show that transport may explain around 70% of the variations in living standards in the world.

The interplay between transport and demographic changes, such as ageing populations, the rise of the middle class, and the increase in women's labor market participation, are precursors of significant increase in demand for mobility and transport. While this is a challenge, it is also an opportunity for safer, cleaner and more efficient transport systems.

There are four key dimensions of sustainable transport:

- 1) Access – integrating countries in a broader market to eradicate poverty
- 2) Affordability
- 3) Safety and security
- 4) Environmental aspects

Why is it so important for transport to be included in the sustainable development framework as an independent Sustainable Development Goal? Trends illustrate that in areas included in the Millennium Development Goals, Official Development Assistance (ODA) has acted as a driver, thereby helping to focus on development priorities. E.g.: health: ODA has more than doubled. The picture is not the same for transport and so the inclusion of transport in a Sustainable Development framework is crucial.

As part of the global project called For Future Inland Transport Systems (ForFITS), UNECE in cooperation with the other Regional Commissions has developed a decision making support tool for mitigating climate change impacts by helping to assess a country's CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from inland transport. ForFITS has a dual function. It helps building CO<sub>2</sub> safe scenarios and it also includes a policy converter thus assisting governments in assessing the potential impacts on CO<sub>2</sub> emissions of various policy options before they actually implement them. It also offers international comparisons.

**Car-sharing** is for people who do not need cars to get to work every day. It is the future of car mobility for many others. Cities are becoming dense and there is no space for parking and driving. With current demographic developments and ageing populations it is becoming evident that cars are not the right mode of transportation. Car ownership is also costly. It is approximately 14% to 18% of total household income in North America.

Environmental benefits of car-sharing: 80% reduction in vehicle miles travelled, resulting in drastic CO<sub>2</sub> reductions.

It is important to note that one-way car rental is a self-drive taxi and does not solve the problem as the number of vehicles owned does not decrease. Car-sharing is natural and allows us to maximize the use of vehicles and parking - you get to choose the size of the car for every single trip!

In San Francisco you can drive your own car as a taxi with the help of a smart phone application.

Peers incorporated: partnership - a symbiotic and complementary service is provided. It brings resilience and reduces redundancy. If properly functioning, the platform serves to identify the best performers and provides opportunities for iteration and improving of performance.

Governments should step up to provide insurance to those start-up companies.

These services may help to improve access in underserved areas.

Besides the technological constraints (smart-phone ownership), there is the challenge of profiling and discrimination with pick up. It can, however, be argued that smart phones may help to resolve the issue of racism as race is not revealed when the car is ordered through smart phone applications.

Excess capacity - regulatory constraints (i.e. insurance regulations and subsidy barriers) must be removed. Laws can be put into place to enable people to rent out their own cars if they go through a third party company that prevents them from being held liable for a lawsuit.

## **UNEP**

What is needed to make transport sustainable? There are five key areas of intervention:

1. road safety -infrastructure SDGs
2. public transportation - mass transit
3. air quality - link to health issues
4. fuel consumption - link to energy
5. new technologies

What needs to be done?

1. role played by cities in addition to government action
2. UN system's role in coordination
3. Financing
4. Partnerships
5. A greater focus should be placed on attaining a self-managing structure

Participants noted need to attend to urban design and planning, travel demand management, and need to emphasize capacity for measuring and monitoring performance.

## **Bike sharing systems and smart bikes**

The objectives of a bike sharing system are to enable flexible mobility, reduce CO2 emissions, reduce congestions, reduce fuel consumption, and result in health benefits. Some of its other beneficial characteristics include its baggage racks, weather and vandal proof-ness. Smart phone technology provides real bike and dock availability.

Some of the issues raised with regards to bike sharing systems include:

1. bike availability
2. bike lanes
3. asymmetric flows
4. vandalism
5. helmets
6. insurance (e.g. Valencia offers liability and accident insurance)

The performance of a bike sharing system is measured by the following indicators:

1. accessibility
2. availability of information
3. ease of rental
4. bike availability and condition

In 2009 we observed a major growth in bike rental, with Europe maintaining the lead. In 2013 there were 52 countries with bike sharing systems. In the US alone, 17 new systems were created over the past year. In Greece – 18 new systems were created in 2013 despite the financial difficulties experienced by the country. The systems were funded by the government illustrating their attractiveness. In China alone 30 new systems were created in 2013. However, some countries have

also experienced closures of these systems; Spain for instance saw 34 of its bike sharing systems closing.

Q&A: Who uses the bikes? Data available indicated that the bikes are mainly used for the purpose of commuting. Leisure comes in second place.

### **High Level Segment on Sustainable Transport and Road Safety**

In the high level segment of meeting, the Prime Minister of Jamaica, Hon. Portia Simon-Miller, spoke about decade of action for road safety and how Jamaica has made progress on road safety. Nelson Mandala's granddaughter spoke with emotion about losing her 13-year old daughter to a traffic fatality and the need for road safety. She supports the Long Short Walk Campaign. Shelly Ann Fraser Pryce, "the fastest woman runner in the world," from Jamaica, also spoke about this campaign. Dmitry Maksimychev, Deputy UN Mission head from Russia, spoke about need for Sustainable Transport as key building block for Sustainable Development and how uncontrolled expansion of motorized transport places millions of people at risk and threatens global climate system. In April 2014, Russia will introduce a new UN resolution on road safety.

### **World Bank**

- 1.22 billion people are currently living under the poverty line
- 31% of the rural population does not have access to an all weather road; this isolation has a significant impact on the social and economic activities around the particular rural area, leaving them in a poverty trap.

According to the World Bank's Rural Access Index in Sub-Saharan Africa more than 60% of the population does not have access to an all weather road transport.

Improved rural access offers greater potential for economic growth as it leads to an increase in the exploitation of resources in the rural area in question. Rural access improvement allows market access and market consolidation and the opening up of small businesses. Subsequently, rural access leads to the development of tertiary activities, and provides employment opportunities in different sectors. Improving rural access offers multiple channels to bring people out of poverty.

The largest rural road program was launched in India. As a result household income significantly increased for those connected to the program. Moreover, health access improved as transportation to hospitals was improved as well as the availability of doctors and nurses. Rural access improvements therefore lead to an increase in pregnancy consultations and a decline in maternal deaths and infant mortality. Rural access improvements have positive implications for education, as the percentage of females enrolled in schools increased.

Therefore, it can be said that transport acts as an enabler. It supports the delivery of other essential rural utility services such as water, electricity and sanitation. This improves overall living standards and health conditions and generates income through other economic activities created. Greater focus is needed into studying the impact of these interrelations.

Rural accessibility also plays a key role in post-conflict reconstruction.

Q&A: There is a need for road construction to take into account the characteristics of local communities. Roads have previously been built for vehicles, and not for the people.

### **UN Habitat**

The second half of the consultation meeting began with UN Habitat on "Sustainable Urban Transport and Poverty". UN Habitat is approaching the area of Transport very recently. Their idea is to stress the importance of urban mobility and linking cities and urban areas in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. Their intent is to develop a new model of cities, urban areas and human settlements.

First he gave a brief summary on the development of cities in South Africa and the urgent need for efficient and well planned transportation systems and infrastructures. Many cities are not built yet, therefore there is an unique opportunity to prepare a good urban plan in transport in advance. Already, greater motorization is being experienced and vehicles are increasing. Most of these vehicles are

bought and registered in the South. Many registrations are being noticed in China, South-East Asia and soon in South Africa. The phenomenon observed is that many of those vehicles are bought second hand from the UK, East Africa, Japan or USA. The vehicles however are not fuel efficient. which cause environmental problems. Due to rapid motorization and urbanization, many institutions/foundations have problems dealing with the following challenges:

- Rapid & biggest growth in Africa (especially South Africa)
- Weak institutional framework
- Investment in streets and cars (infrastructure industry)
- Congestions in cities
- Road safety (school children)
- Health impacts of pollution
- Road traffic accidents
- Many cities in the South are collapsing
- Gender (Women) Safety in mobility
- Disabilities
- Displacement of the poor people (displacing slums + big issue)
- Air pollution
- Equitable Urban Mobility
- Policy and Government responses
- Integration of public places cities and informal transport sector

UN habitat is approaching a mixed-use environment strategy, by integrating land-use / non-motorizing infrastructure. They intend for better street design, more walking ability and better use of public places by integrating land use with travel land use. In order to find a right solution, UN Habitat is looking at the city level as well as national level. One of their focuses is the development of a rights based approach. They are currently researching existing human rights instruments of the region to employ existing economic social rights for the promotion of a right based approach. The idea is to benchmark the process in establishing the right to water.

### Discussion

Reflecting on the issues in Namibia activities within the informal transport services is the order of the day. The question therefore revolves around how one can accommodate the informal transport sector into the formal transport family.

The UN Habitat participant replied by stating that there are currently no concrete solutions at hand, however it is a work in progress. It is envisioned to set up a multi-stakeholder forum, where the informal sector will be engaged by inviting their representatives. The idea is to make them part of the discussion and to transform what would otherwise be perceived as a threat into an opportunity for business. Mobile apps and IT-Technology are great supporters within this field. A mobility contract could be one way of approaching this issue, where different actors (Taxi operators, formal operators, major, private sectors) come together and sign a contract and agree how they want to be part of the solution. We are still at the 'work-in-progress stage' and are open for suggestions.

The Namibian participant stated that in his opinion it is very difficult to integrate the informal transport system, in other words to have them participate/incorporated into the system of change. He suggested to integrate the drivers of the informal transport system into the „VIP“ system and to let some become core-owners of the VIP transport system. Moreover, in order to increase mobility, land needs to be reclaimed. In light of that he asked how one is to communicate these issues to African governments, given that transport is not a priority item on their agenda.

The UN Habitat representative replied that he does not have all the answers, but suggests raising awareness via international for a, where public transport should be stressed as an important issue. The

Namibian representative made an additional comment on the issue of connectivity, which requires the need to re-configure the streets in the respective areas.

## **IRU**

### **Global Taxi Network**

The road transport industry is instrumental in interconnecting all businesses to all major world markets, driving trade, creating employment, ensuring a better distribution of wealth and uniting mankind. It plays a crucial role in the daily economic and social life of industrialized and developing countries alike. For this reason, any penalty on road transport is an even greater penalty for the economy as a whole.

Taxis and hire cars with driver services are an integral element of the public transport chain in both urban and rural areas. Thanks to their unmatched flexibility, taxis complement other public transport modes, with 24/7 availability, with customized, door-to-door service for the individual passenger. Highly flexible taxi services play a key role in the sustainable mobility of people, including those with disabilities. They guarantee social cohesion and integration by providing local citizens and visitors with safe, green, flexible and affordable mobility.

In order to attract public and policy attention to the above issues IRU in 2009 launched the Smart Move campaign aimed at placing buses and coaches at the centre of the transport policy-making debate in order to double their use and achieve sustainable mobility for all.

In 2011, the IRU Taxi Group adopted an action plan to launch a joint collective action to improve the image of taxis under the slogan: “Taxi – Anytime, Anywhere” and with common values: flexible, comfortable, green, safe, accessible.

Suggestions that were introduced for the SDG (Sustainable Development Goals) are:

- Establish at UN level - as a global UN objective - the ambitious and yet realistic objective of doubling the use of collective passenger transport by 2030.
- Create a UN High Level Group (HLG) of key public and private stakeholders to work out a proposal for a UN framework on how to achieve the objective of “doubling”.
- Create, as a follow up, similar HLGs at regional and/or national level to work out specific regional/national plans.
- Involve actively private industry and customers into this process.

## Discussion

A question was raised by one of the participants as to what effect this transport system would have on traffic congestion. How can Taxis be a solution for public transport?

The IRU representatives explained that in certain areas of a city the time frame makes it unfeasible to drive one’s own car, therefore inexpensive taxi service would be perfectly suited for this. The purpose of this system is not to substitute public transport, but to supply an additional useful service.

Another question was raised in regards to the regulation of taxis. It was clarified that the type of regulation depends on the city or country.

## **Asian Development Bank (ADB)**

Mr. Tumiwa began with a brief update on the commitments the multi-national banks made in Rio+20 on sustainable transport and on their current stage of process.

He then predicted that the current challenges triggered by increasing demand for private cars and motorcycles in South East Asia and rising motorization in South East Asia are will lead to problems such as:

Congestion, air pollution, climate change, decreased road safety

Update on Sustainable Transport Initiative:

- Established a Multilateral Development Bank working group on sustainable transport
- Met to agree on an operational plan for the coming decade
- Established a technical working group, which is tasked with developing a framework for rating sustainable transport landing
- To produce first progress report by the end of 2013

- Invited representatives from the partnership for low carbon transport

Thoughts and ideas on how to help the UN in the Post 2015 sustainable development framework:

- Working alongside and support the UN
- ADB has the possibility for innovate projects to sustainable transport
- Conduct capacity building and support policy dialogue for sustainable transport

### Discussion

ADB stated that their way of developing programs within South East is by going along/adjusting with the changes in South East Asia and their policies, e.g. changes in energy policies. ADB does not lend for transmission lines in the streets anymore. Since the challenges in Asia (the bulk of their lending goes to: China, India, Indonesia) are a holistic urban set and moving towards middle income status, the focus of ADB has shifted. ADB is restricted to the politics of the respective country. ADB has found large capacities in the main cities in South East Asia, but it is hard for cities and the sustainable transport system to keep up with its fast urbanization.

On the question of how to progress in making lending more sustainable, the following was replied:

- Multiple criteria assessment framework
- Look at project types and move away from road funding and more towards public investment, public, transport, urban transport, rail

Besides that there is still a lack of clarity as to what is sustainable. The greater challenge is on how to measure improvement on accessibility. Public transport systems are sustainable but as a low income development city that cannot afford to invest much into building a sustainable transport system it needs to prioritize, which is very difficult.

### **World Resource Institute EMBARQ**

Mr. Dalkman gave a brief introduction on their momentum to position sustainable transport towards the sustainable development goals. During his presentation he emphasized on how one can link sustainable transport into the process, since it is unlikely that sustainable transport will be a separate goal. For that one need to address the social, economic and environmental dimension. Targets and indicators need to be incorporated from an economic and finance perspective. There is a wide range of other issues that need to be addressed, including:

- Better communication of goals
- Monitoring and writing of reports
- Goals relevant to decision-makers.

In regards to this the Sustainable Local Transport Partnership has set three main goals:

The first is set on accessibility and economics.

The goal is to enable urban households' access to jobs, goods and services within a 30 min. time radius and to establish a measureable target around rural accessibility,

The second is embedded in the social context, building on existing road safety commitments

Third goal takes an environmental perspective.

Additionally, Mr. Dalman emphasized on the important role of finance, governance and institutions.

### Mixed/Breakout Discussions

Points and statement mentioned:

- Brining the different voices in the partnership together convening that and also ensuring that we try to speak with one voice
- Practicality, look at what we know we already have e.g. on going projects
- Not to re-invent the wheel
- Regarding the process, there is a need to be pragmatic and set achievable targets

- Number of goals must be limited, easy to understand, manageable, easy to promote with the media. Goals need to be evidence-based, scientifically sound and achievable
- There is a need for clearer definitions, using road fatalities as an example of a term needing clarification. Delegates emphasized: the importance of data collection.

One issue was raised by a delegate on countries that have no access to ports and seas. For countries with accessibility it is a major asset for their economic growth and the only case where this does not apply is for Western European countries, due to policy restrictions. It is a neglect dimension of access. This has consequences on the global trade system.

Another delegate mentioned the negative side of transport systems, but pointed out the need to rather highlight the positive elements of what transport can do. Eventually, implementing sustainable transport systems will lead to savings and therefore increase GDP, which will benefit the people of the country.

The UN Habitat participant pointed out that the current MDGs are very process oriented, but do not consider outcomes of increased access to water and sanitation. Neither do they take into account the impact on productivity and improved health levels. In regards to the next SDGs the focus should be on the outcomes, targets and goals.

He also invited the group to think beyond 2015. Another opportunity is provided in 2016 at the UN Habitat conference. The conference will be dealing with new paradigms or visions for urban settlements, mobility and sustainable transport solutions.

Andre Dzikus, **UN Habitat**, presented on 2013 Global Report on Human Settlements followed by panel discussion.

Statement made by the Columbia University Professor:

- We shall not make the mistake again and build highways in city centers or in cities in general.

### **Results Framework**

A working group composed of a representative from each of Africa, Asia, Europe, Latin America and Middle East continued discussion on a results framework.

Sustainable Transport Goal:

To provide access to goods and services through clean, safe, reliable, affordable transport, and land use planning.

Access:

*Urban households are, on average, able to access jobs, goods and services within half an hour by quality, affordable public transport and/or walking and cycling infrastructure*

It was noted that an average design target of half an hour each way for walking is reasonable and could mean a 2 to 4 km radius while for cycling this could expand to 4 to 12 km. It was noted that public transport users often add 10 to 20 minutes walking to their total trip and that this is beneficial to maintain health.

For cities of more than 350,000 land use planning should strive for transit oriented development with densities of more than 5,000 person dwellings per km<sup>2</sup>, mixed income housing, mixed use – commercial, small scale industrial, institutional and housing. Density should also accommodate 40% public space – green space, sidewalks, cycling paths and public transport facilities. Cities should aim for a modal share of non-motorized and public transport of at least 50%.<sup>1</sup>

*Rural households and businesses have access to all-weather transport services for taking products*

---

<sup>1</sup> Numerical targets need further research and validation.



*to market and obtaining essential services;*

It is difficult to set distances or time for targets in the rural context but there is good evidence that increasing the number of villages served by road or other modes will have dramatic development results. [target to halve the number of unserved villages in developing countries?]

For freight it was felt that ton-km/GDP was a more general figure and that the cost of transport/GDP would be useful for comparison purposes. Modal share should shift towards rail and waterway from air and road with a target for increasing the existing share.

[All modes should strive for efficiency improvement by 2030?]

#### Social:

Health benefits of sustainable transport systems include

- space for safe healthy outdoor exercise is provided and encouraged
- air pollution from passenger and freight transport is halved by 2025 with benefits to non-communicable respiratory illness
- traffic related fatalities are cut in half by 2030 compared to 2005 with an ultimate vision toward zero fatalities;

Equity benefits:

- design for accommodation of the very poor, gender, disabled, children, and the aged.
- Facilitate social interaction including for religion, entertainment, culture and family gatherings

Air pollution from passenger and freight transport is halved by 2030 compared to 2005, and GHG emissions from transport peak globally by 2020 with an ultimate vision of 40-60% reductions by 2050 compared to 2005 levels or as compatible with the UNFCCC agreement.

#### Economics:

Reductions in time spent travelling is an indicator of productivity both for people and goods.

Infrastructure investment relative to GDP and perperson

Transport operational cost /GDP and /Person

Existence of intelligent Transport Systems for information and management

Jobs created in the transport sector

Jobs enabled by improved transport and access

#### Environmental:

Reductions in air pollution relative to WHO guidelines Particulate Mater, Volatile Organic Compounds, Nitrogen Oxides, Hydro Carbons

Reductions in Greenhouse Gas emissions and black carbon relative to UNFCCC targets

Waste management

Water pollution

Noise reduction

Enhancement of biodiversity and carbon sequestration stocks in green areas

Policy and Finance:

Decision making includes cost benefit analysis including environment, economy and society

% investment in non-motorised transport, % in public transport in projects, cities and countries

% invested in rural transport access

Public –private partnerships

Overseas Donor Aid

Foreign direct investment

Established Institutional Capacity for development and management of transport and land use

- tracking of emissions and national benefits
- capacity to implement Nationally Appropriate Mitigation Actions for Transport

Existence of laws, standards and regulations

Collection of user fees

Enforcement of bylaws

Inclusive and transparent transport consultation processes

Capacity to disseminate and learn from other cities, countries and regions